

**MINISTRY FOR WOMEN** 

# STAKEHOLDER FEEDBACK



REPORT August 2017

# Contents

### Stakeholder Feedback

### Disclaimer

Research First notes that the views presented in the report do not necessarily represent the views of Ministry for Women. In addition, the information in this report is accurate to the best of the knowledge and belief of Research First Ltd. While Research First Ltd has exercised all reasonable skill and care in the preparation of information in this report, Research First Ltd accepts no liability in contract, tort, or otherwise for any loss, damage, injury or expense, whether direct, indirect, or consequential, arising out of the provision of information in this

1	Key I	Messages	3
	1.1	Supporting Women and Girls in Education	4
	1.2	Utilising Women's Skills and Growing our Economy	4
	1.3	Encouraging and Developing Women Leaders	5
	1.4	Ensuring Women and Girls are Free of Violence	5
	1.5	Managing of International Reporting Obligations	5
2	Back	ground	6
	2.1	Research Design	7
3	Key I	Measures	8
	3.1	Incorporation of the Ministry's Evidence, Analysis and Advice into Policies and Practices	8
	3.2	High Quality and Timely Information and Appropriate CEDAW Report Consultation for International Reporting Stakeholders	10
	3.3	Satisfaction with the Ministry's Nomination Services and Nominees	11
	3.4	Satisfaction with the Ministry's Advice and Support for NACEW	12
4	Stak	eholders were Generally Satisfied	13
	4.1	The Ministry Does Important Work	13
	4.2	The Ministry Performs its Functional Role Well	15
	4.3	The Ministry Develops Strong Personal Relationships	17
5	But,	There is Still Room for Improvement	19
	5.1	Proactive Information Sharing	19
	5.2	Intersectionality	21
	5.3	Strengthen Stakeholder Relationships	24
6	Perce	eptions of the Ministry	26
	6.1	The Ministry Delivers a Thorough Service	28
	6.2	The Ministry gives Good Nominations Advice	28
7	Арре	endix One: Interview Questionnaires	29

# Key Messages

The majority of stakeholders (82%) report that the Ministry's evidence, analysis and advice is incorporated into their policies and practices:



#### Education & **Training**

8 out of 14 stakeholders 'agreed' or 'strongly agreed'



#### Growing Skills

**11** out of **12** stakeholders 'agreed' or 'strongly agreed'



#### Leadership

**16** out of **22** stakeholders 'agreed' or 'strongly agreed'



#### Safety from Violence

9 out of 13 stakeholders 'agreed' or 'strongly agreed'

# 93% of stakeholders report that the work they do with the Ministry is 'valuable' or 'very valuable'

The results show that while the Ministry is impacting in a positive way, there is still room for improvement. Stakeholders do not agree that the Ministry is a trusted source of information about Maori women; there are concerns about the level of pro-activity from the Ministry; and there is a perception that the most vulnerable and poor women in society are not being well represented by the Ministry.

#### International

6 of 10 stakeholders 'agreed' or 'strongly agreed' that they were provided with Governments CEDAW report (three were unable to answer)

#### Nomination Services

All (three) stakeholders rated the quality of the Ministry's nominations service as 'meeting requirements' or better; with two stakeholders rating the service as 'excellent'

#### **NACEW**

All (eight) stakeholders rated their satisfaction with the Ministry's Advice and Support as 'met requirements' or better; two stakeholders rating the service as 'excellent'

# Snapshot of Performance Metrics by Consultation Area

### Supporting Women and Girls in Education

- Of the fourteen stakeholders who had interacted with the Ministry regarding education in the last year, eight of them had incorporated their evidence, analysis and advice into their policies and practices.
- 12 of the 14 stakeholders considered the work undertaken by the Ministry to be 'valuable' or 'very valuable'
- 9 of the 14 stakeholders 'agree' or 'strongly agree' that the Ministry is a trusted source of knowledge about all women; and 8 of the 14 stakeholders 'agree' or 'strongly agree' that the Ministry is a trusted source of knowledge about Maori women
  - Lateral of the Ministry) have given us a new set of skills in terms of coping and how to conduct ourselves around the board room"
  - 😉 "It was only through the Ministry for Women that we changed our focus...it was their encouragement that helped us to do it"

# 1.2 Utilising Women's Skills and Growing our Economy

- Of the twelve stakeholders who had interacted with the Ministry regarding skill growth, eleven had incorporated the Ministry's advice and analysis into their policies and practices.
  - 😉 "It is really good when government agencies work together, and certainly when you are getting people who have roles in the Ministry for Women, and you've got principal advisors for women and for youth which link people together. They can help each other learn each other's jobs and we all win"
- 11 of the 12 stakeholders considered the work undertaken by the Ministry to be 'valuable' or 'very valuable'
  - Le "It is a very focussed brief they deliver. They focus on women, women's issues and the advancement of women"
- 6 of the 12 stakeholders 'agree' or 'strongly agree' that the Ministry is a trusted source of knowledge about all women; and 5 of the 12 stakeholders 'agree' or 'strongly agree' that the Ministry is a trusted source of knowledge about Maori women

# 1.3 Encouraging and Developing Women Leaders

- Of the twenty-two stakeholders who had interacted with the Ministry regarding leadership, sixteen had incorporated the Ministry's advice and analysis into their policies and practices.
- All twenty-two of the stakeholders considered the work undertaken by the Ministry to be 'valuable' or 'very valuable'
  - "it is their body of knowledge and evidence, and provision of high quality policy and practical advice that works"
- 17 of the 22 stakeholders 'agree' or 'strongly agree' that the Ministry is a trusted source of knowledge about all women; and 9 of the 22 stakeholders 'agree' or 'strongly agree' that the Ministry is a trusted source of knowledge about Maori women

# 1.4 Ensuring Women and Girls are Free of Violence

- Of the 13 stakeholders who had interacted with the Ministry in this area, 9 had incorporated the Ministry's advice and analysis into their policies and practices.
- All 13 stakeholders considered the work undertaken by the Ministry to be 'valuable' or 'very valuable'
  - "They took a narrow view which was helpful in terms of providing that clear perspective"
- 8 of the 13 stakeholders 'agree' or 'strongly agree' that the Ministry is a trusted source of knowledge about all women; and 5 of the 13 stakeholders 'agree' or 'strongly agree' that the Ministry is a trusted source of knowledge about Maori women

### 1.5 Managing of International Reporting Obligations

- Of the 13 stakeholders who had interacted with the Ministry in this area, 12 'agreed' or 'strongly agreed' that they were provided with high-quality and timely information and have been appropriately consulted on the Governments CEDAW report.
- 12 of the 13 stakeholders considered the work undertaken by the Ministry to be 'valuable' or 'very valuable'
  - "They are very active in terms of raising the profile for women's affairs and I think it's great to have them there"
- 7 of the 13 stakeholders 'agree' or 'strongly agree' that the Ministry is a trusted source of knowledge about all women; and 2 of the 13 stakeholders 'agree' or 'strongly agree' that the Ministry is a trusted source of knowledge about Maori women.
  - "Ministry for Women is a good example of how to do it right. Their reporting is always top notch".

# Background

The Ministry for Women (the Ministry) have a requirement to ensure that stakeholders' feedback is sourced annually. This research project involved interviewing key stakeholders across the Ministry's five priority areas:

- 1. Supporting more women and girls in education and training (Education and Training)
- 2. Utilising women's skills and growing our economy (Growing Skills)
- 3. Encouraging and developing women leaders (Leadership)
- 4. Ensuring women and girls are free from violence (Safety from Violence)
- 5. Managing the Government's international reporting obligations (International)

The research programme also obtained feedback on the quality of the Nomination Services and support provided to the National Advisory Council on the Employment of Women (NACEW) as follows:

- Nomination Services: Key appointing agencies' satisfaction with the quality of nominees and nomination services provided to them.
- National Advisory Council on the Employment of Women: Council member satisfaction with the advice and support provided to the Council.



# 2.1 Research Design

The 2017 research design followed similar research that has been conducted by Research First annually since 2014. As in previous years, Research First completed this research by telephone survey with key stakeholders of the Ministry. Telephone surveys were chosen as they provide the best combination of timeliness, cost effectiveness and data quality. Contact lists were provided by the Ministry. All potential participants on the lists provided were approached and invited to participate in the research.

Stakeholders were given one of 3 surveys, based on the services they used. To ensure that the key metrics can be compared over time, questions have been kept largely the same, with just one additional question in the 2017 survey. Those who used nomination services or were members of NACEW were given separate surveys, while those who used the Ministry's five essential services (Education and Training, Growing Skills, Leadership, Safety from Violence, and International Reporting) were given the main survey. Copies of these surveys are available in the appendix.

Stakeholder responses were organised according to the areas in which they had worked or consulted with the Ministry in the last 12 months. Some of the participants had used multiple services provided by the Ministry and their responses have been attributed to all relevant business areas.

Table 2.1: Stakeholders Interviewed

	Total Responses	Total Respondents
Education	14	3
Growing Skills	12	3
Leadership	22	14
Safety	13	10
International	13	10
Other	2	2
Multiple	-	13
Total	76	55
Nominations	3	3
NACEW	8	8
Total	87	67



# Key Measures

### 3.1 Incorporation of the Ministry's Evidence, Analysis and Advice into Policies and **Practices**

Stakeholders participating in the main survey were asked to rate how much they agreed or disagreed that their agency had incorporated Ministry evidence, analysis and advice into their policies and practices. This was asked using a fivepoint scale where 1= strongly disagree and 5= strongly agree.

Four-fifths of stakeholders (82%) who responded to this question, indicated that they had incorporated the evidence, analysis or advice into their policies and practices. Only one respondent disagreed that they had incorporated the evidence, analysis or advice received into policies and practices; a further nine respondents neither agreed or disagreed with the statement.

Table 3.1 Incorporation of the Ministry's evidence, analysis and advice, for each agency

	(n=14)	Growing Skills (n=12)	(n=22)	Safety from Violence (n= 13)	International (n=13)	Other (n=2)	Total Responses (n=76)
Strongly Agree	2	3	7	2	1	0	15
Agree	6	8	9	7	1	1	32
Neutral	2	1	4	2	0	0	9
Disagree	1	0	0	0	0	0	1
Strongly Disagree	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
N/A	3	0	2	2	11	1	19

Stakeholders provided examples of how their agency had incorporated the Ministry's services into their policies and practices. The information received from the Ministry was used by stakeholders to inform or support future projects, policies and helping to set and meet specific targets.

- Some of the papers I have written for decisions made by our senior leadership team contained research that came from the Ministry For Women."
- "Predominately the research related to some of the factors that contribute to the gender pay gap in New Zealand."
- **!** "We set ourselves a target to achieve in the recruitment for Maori and Pacific trades training from the Ministry for Women – they (the Ministry) challenged us to get to the target of 30%."
- "We use their research to inform our future projects."

- "We use quotable data as to how woman are advancing in relation to board appointments, higher leadership and equal pay, to benchmark our organisation so that we continue to be a leading employer."
- Lateral "The 2009 research has been integral in the evidence base for the policy we worked on. Their (the Ministry's) feedback helped us better identify the gender implications."
- **!** "We have looked at it, read through it, and incorporated some of the ideas, but we haven't put it down as a mandate to the constitution or anything like that."
- Let "I talk about those pieces of research all the time."
- "We have included a lot of it in our work, but that is primarily because we take a holistic or greater view of diversity and inclusion. We are not just female focused."
- "We have picked up the future directors programme, and make sure it is promoted through our boards."
- 2 "We have introduced the recommendation that companies should have a policy addressing diversity and we report against these recommendations."
- **L** "A lot of our campaigns for recruiting trainees are from the research from the Ministry for Women. We have actively used their research to gain traction in that space."
- "We are looking at practice guidelines that have come about through their research. More recently the research around the voice of Pasifika women is helpful for what we are developing."

# 3.2 High Quality and Timely Information and Appropriate CEDAW Report Consultation for International Reporting Stakeholders

Stakeholders who engaged with the Ministry regarding international reporting obligations were asked to rate how much they agreed or disagreed that their agency was provided with high quality and timely information, and was properly consulted on the Government's CEDAW report. This was also reported on a five-point scale where 1=strongly disagree and 5=strongly agree.

6 of the 10 respondents agreed with the statement, with only one participant disagreeing.

Table 3.2: Quality of Provision of Information and Appropriate Consultation For International Reporting Stakeholders

	Total Respondents
Strongly Agree	2
Agree	4
Neutral	3
Disagree	1
Strongly Disagree	0
Total	10*

<sup>\*</sup>Of 13 International respondents, 3 chose not to answer this question

### 3.3 Satisfaction with the Ministry's Nomination Services and Nominees

Stakeholders who engaged with the Ministry in regards to their nomination services were asked to rate their satisfaction with the quality of nominees and the nomination services. This was asked using a five-point scale where 1= does not meet requirements and 5= excellent.

All respondents reported that the nominees and nomination services met their requirements, and 2 of the 3 rated the services as excellent. The services provided by the Ministry were reported to be efficient and reliable, and participants considered diverse boards important.

- Providing quality and timely advice."
- 😉 "Real consistency in their reliability. You can always count on them to respond and respond with what you are after. I cannot remember a time when they haven't done that."
- "They meet their requirement well, they generally give high quality nominations."
- 😉 "It is important that we have a reasonable demographic spread of appointees."
- Late our target to have 50% of women on Government boards."

Table 3.3: Satisfaction with the Quality of Nomination Services and Nominees

	Total Respondents
Excellent	2
More than met requirements	0
Met requirements	1
Partially met requirements	0
Did not meet requirements	0
Total	3

# 3.4 Satisfaction with the Ministry's Advice and Support for NACEW

Members of NACEW rated their level of satisfaction with the Ministry's advice, and the quality of the support for NACEW. This was asked using a five-point scale where 1=did not meet requirements and 5=excellent.

All respondents reported that the Ministry's advice and support met requirements, but only a quarter rated the services excellent. The main reason cited for the service being rated lower than excellent was due to information not being provided within the agreed timelines.

- Some of our meetings have been changed and this was due to the availability of the Minister. At the last meeting, some requested information was not followed up by the Ministry."
- Lateral The advice can be a little slow to come through and I just wonder sometimes how thorough some of their research is."

Table 3.4: Satisfaction with the Ministry's Advice and Support for NACEW

	Total Respondents
Excellent	2
More than met requirements	2
Met requirements	4
Partially met requirements	0
Did not meet requirements	0
Total	8

4

# Stakeholders were Generally Satisfied

Stakeholders for all sections except NACEW were asked to comment on their satisfaction with the services of the Ministry. Overall, the results show high levels of satisfaction with the services provided by the Ministry. Key themes in the findings are similar to those observed in the 2014-2016 research, highlighting the following areas of strength:

- 1. The Ministry does important work contributing to "a worthwhile cause"
- 2. The Ministry performs its functional role well (i.e. evidence, analysis and advice provision)
- 3. Ministry staff build strong relationships with key stakeholders

### 4.1 The Ministry Does Important Work

The majority of stakeholders hold great value in the advocacy, support and research of women's issues, with 93% of respondents rating the work of the Ministry as valuable. These are just some examples of how information provided by the Ministry is adding value to stakeholders organisations:

- "They have expert knowledge on issues relating to women's rights and the empowerment of women. They have a good understanding of New Zealand's domestic policies and how these play out internationally."
- Late of the Manual of the Ministry for Women that we changed our focus and actually went about attracting more Maori and Pacific women onto the Maori and Pacific trades training."
- "The Ministry for Women's focus in their interactions with us is solely on the impact of family violence on women and children. They took a narrow view and it was helpful in terms in providing that clear perspective."
- "They have been a great connection for us, to the public sector.

  They support the programme we have been running."
- "There is a strong desire for the Ministry for Women to be more valuable to us. We all share the same objectives but we are finding it hard to see where we can work synergistically together to deliver on those objectives."
- "They provide another perspective, they are really knowledgeable and they are the experts behind a lot of the policy and legislation on women's rights, so we really enjoy working with them and using that knowledge"

- "They add value by providing up to date research based evidence on issues that are relevant to our work programme"
- Le "Well, I think it works because we have got a common goal, so there is a lot of shared ownership of issues and we are looking towards working towards the same outcomes."

Table 4.1 Value of the Ministry's work, for each agency

	(n=14)	Growing Skills (n=12)	Leadership (n=22)	Safety from Violence (n= 13)	International (n=13)	Other (n=2)	Total Responses (n=76)
Very Valuable	6	6	12	6	5	0	35
Valuable	6	5	10	7	7	1	36
Neutral	1	0	0	0	1	0	2
Not Valuable	1	1	0	0	0	1	3
Not Valuable at all	0	0	0	0	0	0	0

### 4.2 The Ministry Performs its Functional Role Well

Stakeholders are satisfied with the Ministry's ability to provide expertise on the topic of women's issues. Their advice is perceived as well researched and useful, and presented with honesty and integrity.

- "We know they work hard, are under-funded and give good value. I do not know how often their advice to government ministers is pushed back. Any piece of research or information they provide, regarding women on state sector boards, is really high quality. It is well reasoned and accurate. They genuinely advocate for women in New Zealand."
- 😉 "They push me and my organisation. They are open, and show us how we can improve the lives of women and girls in our country."
- Le "They do what they say they will do"
- Late of the first first that the fraining is relevant. The training is up to date, and is offered quite frequently. They might not be hosting the forum, but if they know of anything that will benefit our organisation we are given opportunities to attend. So they are very good at filtering out the relevant information."

#### 4.2.1 Satisfaction with the Ministry's Advice

37 of 76 responses were satisfied with the advice provided by the Ministry. A further 23 respondents were neither satisfied or dissatisfied, with 11 stakeholders reporting that they were dissatisfied with the advice of the Ministry. Stakeholders working in the Safety and Violence area were more dissatisfied than other stakeholders.

- 😉 " They have always provided very valuable advice based on their expertise."
- Le "They provided the feedback we sought but in a way that was really helpful and easy to incorporate."
- "What I like about the service of the Ministry is that if you ask a question, you may not like the answer but you will always get an answer that is well thought out, research based, designed to be solution focused, honest, and if they don't know they will find 011t."
- Because things were provided in a very structured way, there was always evidence to back up what was being said, and it was provided. There were some good research reports that were provided to us as a back up to what was discussed."
- Lateral They provide another perspective, they are really knowledgeable and they are the experts behind a lot of the policy and legislation on women's rights"

Reasons for dissatisfaction centre on a lack of direction about how to use the information provided and on the robustness of some of the information provided.

- 😂 "Research is there, but no practical piece of what can be done with the findings. There is not the leverage of follow through, again possibly a capacity problem."
- 😉 " I would prefer to have more robust information on Pacific women, which is lacking."

Table 4.2 Satisfaction with the Ministry's Advice

	(n=14)	Growing Skills (n=12)	(n=22)	Safety from Violence (n= 13)	International (n=13)	Other (n=2)	Total Responses (n=76)
Very Satisfied	1	0	4	0	1	0	6
Satisfied	7	7	8	4	4	1	31
Neutral	3	3	8	3	5	1	23
Not Satisfied	1	2	0	4	2	0	9
Not Satisfied at all	1	0	0	1	0	0	2
N/A	1	0	2	1	1	0	5

# 4.3 The Ministry Develops Strong Personal Relationships

Just over three quarters of stakeholders were satisfied with their interactions with the Ministry. The quality of staff and how they interact with stakeholders is vital to the perceived 'success' of the Ministry. The staff are reported to be dedicated, 'going the extra mile' to obtain relevant information and to provide useful advice. The attitude of staff members and the relationships they build with stakeholders gives the Ministry a reputation for being helpful and committed to women's issues. Stakeholders value the collaborative nature of their relationships with the Ministry.

- 😉 "It was very helpful that the Minister herself was very enthusiastic about the research and pushed it right up the priority scale."
- "The honesty and integrity of the people that work there is very high. They tell me when they can help me and when they cannot and tell me where to get the information. Extremely helpful. [We were lucky with whoever has employed the people that work there"
- Late of the first extremely knowledgeable about the process, was committed to making sure that the process came to fruition and delivered a positive end result."
- From the emails and interactions that we've had, whether it is statements, resolutions, or written statements, they always provide feedback. It can be quite simple changes or it can be a little bit more in depth. But it is just going that little bit above and beyond. They could just come back and say, 'yes, the statement or resolution is fine, good luck', but they usually provide some good feedback."
- Because they've gone over and above what we've asked for"
- "The particular person I dealt with was professional, collaborative, always timely and I had no problems at all working with them"
- Le "They have got absolutely committed, focussed and enthusiastic people who are very devoted to the advancement of women."
- Late "I have had a positive interaction with every person I have worked with there. I have good relationships with the people who work there."

 $Table\ 4.3: Satisfaction\ with\ the\ Ministry's\ Interaction\ with\ Stakeholders$ 

	(n=14)	Growing Skills (n=12)	(n=22)	Safety from Violence (n= 13)	International (n=13)	Other (n=2)	Total Responses (n=76)
Very Satisfied	8	6	14	7	6	2	43
Satisfied	3	4	3	3	2	0	15
Neutral	2	1	5	3	4	0	15
Not Satisfied	1	1	0	0	1	0	3
Not Satisfied at all	0	0	0	0	0	0	0
N/A	0	0	0	0	0	0	0



# But, There is Still Room for Improvement

### 5.1 Proactive Information Sharing

Despite the high satisfaction of its stakeholders, there is still confusion over the role and priorities of the Ministry. Some respondents were unaware of the full repertoire of services available, only being aware of the services they actually use. This leads to missed opportunities for collaboration, and for inaccurate or confused expectations of the Ministry. This finding is consistent with learnings from the 2015 and 2016 reports.

- "I cannot really say that I have expectations, I do not even know what sort of expectations I could have-this goes back to not knowing exactly what their services are."
- \*I guess in general more visibility about what the Ministry for Women does... I know they have a website and all of that, but to actually put stuff out in a regular kind of newsletter on 'this is what we are working on at the moment' or 'this is interesting, look at what we've come across', whatever it is."
- "Be more communicative, (I am) not sure if they are even on Facebook or Twitter. They should make more thought out suggestions, rather than just throw ideas at us; be more supportive of what we are doing."
- "In the last 12 months, it has been a bit quiet from the Ministry. I get a lot of the information indirectly from other sources who are engaging with the Ministry."
- \*Perhaps they could make some of their research publications or views more publicly visible. I have had a one-on-one relationship with an advisor but I have not seen a lot of research or Ministry documents out there in the public arena. Well I suppose its perhaps the Ministry needs to be seen as a key strategic thought leader in government around women's issues."

Respondents believed the Ministry should have a greater voice in both governmental and public situations. The Ministry is perceived as a leader and advocate for women's issues, and because of this is expected to be a vocal party in all relevant discussions. Being present and active in discussions can drive the positioning of the Ministry as an advocate for women, as well as being a source of information.

"Be more visible in the community."

- "I believe that as a group, who do this as a day job, they should be bringing more things to us. They should be more proactive about employment issues for New Zealand women and what needs to be done about it."
- It think they definitely need to make connections and maybe promote their services more. I would have to look at the website to see what other services I could access because I have not looked wider than what our need was."

It is important that the Ministry for Women is seen to seek and share information that is sourced from a wide variety of resources. Stakeholders want to be reassured that all information shared is relevant and up to date.

It is also important that the Ministry is able to present the relevant people at meetings, and to hold those meetings in appropriate venues.

- "The information is not broad enough in scope, though I trust what they do put out. [There is] no needs assessment through a gender lens available on the website. Specific reports are on their website but not the higher-level analysis or research. If it can, the Ministry's website should be a repository of research from universities."
- For the international reporting and gender implication questions in cabinet papers, offering more guidance and interaction with other departments on populating those."
- "If the Ministry want to be more proactive, they need to have the ability to tap into industries, would be a more practical link. They do not have specific data about South Auckland."
- "I think at the moment there is a really big willingness and a big push for the government agencies to work together better. It is not just about the Ministry for Women but all government agencies to be more engaged with other community and government agencies."
- "On a very practical note their spaces are too small for the size of groups they want to talk to. They need to collaborate more with other agencies to get the spaces for us to meet. They know who they need at certain meetings and they need to be more proactive getting the right people there."
- Sending information about various statements New Zealand is making about women and girls in the Pacific would be helpful to an NGO like mine."

# 5.2 Intersectionality

Ministry for Women is seen by 62% of respondents as a trusted source of knowledge about all women in New Zealand, but only 40% agreed they are trusted source of knowledge about Maori women. Statistically, there was no change between the 2016 and 2017 results.

Some stakeholders saw the Ministry as a trusted source of knowledge because they believed that was their role, while others relied on their previous interactions with the Ministry to fuel their opinion.

- Late "I see them as the main entity that does that work and the research and provides advice and shapes policy."
- Late of the formation for the formation for the contraction for th purposes that I would need it."
- 2 "I quess because its the main population group they look at. Ministry for Women look at Women."
- 2 "In terms of evidence, I don't know of any other experts other than the Maori Women's Welfare League"
- 😉 "I assume that is an important part of the Ministry's mission, aims and goals and that is what I hope the Ministry endeavours to do. Judging by my knowledge of the people who work there, I assume that they would agree with that and try their best to deliver that."
- Late of the second seco knowledge regarding women in New Zealand."
- Late of the civil society sector is poor and could do with some additional resourcing, time and energy to actually understand what is happening on the ground with some sectors of women in New Zealand"
- "They have a good understanding of a whole range of issues that affect women domestically, and they are at the forefront of dealing with those issues."

Table 5.1 Agreement that the Ministry is a Trusted Source of Knowledge, Over Time

	2014 (n=35)	2015 (n=28)	2016 (n=43)	2017 (n=55)
Is a trusted source of knowledge about all women in New Zealand	57%	54%	70%	62%
Is a trusted source of knowledge about Maori women	28%	39%	37%	40%

Table 5.2: The Ministry is a trusted source of information about all women

	Education (n=14)	Growing Skills (n=12)	(n=22)	Safety from Violence (n= 13)	International (n=13)	Other (n=2)	Total Responses (n=76)
Strongly Agree	4	3	2	3	1	2	15
Agree	5	3	15	5	6	0	34
Neutral	3	5	5	4	3	0	20
Disagree	2	1	0	1	3	0	7
Strongly Disagree	0	0	0	0	0	0	0

Table 5.3: The Ministry is a trusted source of information about Maori women

	Education (n=14)	Growing Skills (n=12)	Leadership (n=22)	Safety from Violence (n= 13)	International (n=13)	Other (n=2)	Total Responses (n=76)
Strongly Agree	2	2	3	3	0	0	10
Agree	6	3	6	2	2	2	21
Neutral	2	4	11	7	8	0	32
Disagree	2	1	1	0	1	0	5
Strongly Disagree	0	0	0	0	1	0	1
Don't Know	2	2	1	1	1	0	7

The groups least confident in the Ministry's knowledge were consulting on Growing Skills, Leadership and Safety from Violence. This may be due to the needs and expectations of groups who work in these areas, particularly around proper representation.

The Ministry is seen as representing women as a collective, rather than focussing specifically on the needs of all of the different groups of women. Stakeholders who did not see the Ministry as a trusted source felt there were specific groups of women who were not sufficiently represented by the Ministry.

- 😉 "I would like to see the Ministry for Women take an interest in mothers raising children in South Auckland and the connection to poverty. If they had that same focus and enthusiasm that was seen with women in trades training, then I think that would add value to our work."
- "Well, I think a real effort [is needed] to engage the NGO sector more from a society point of view, and I would relate that to the need to do that under the sustainable development goals,"
- Lateral They could be more proactive with Pasifika and reaching out to the mainstream agencies. Focus on the whole population lens not just family violence. Ministry for Women could very helpful in doing this."

- "I think broaden their interest in collaboration beyond the focus on trade training."
- Lateral are aspects of our community I do not hear them talking about, other women's groups have stepped in like Global Women and Super Diverse Women. The research is very broad, it could be more segmented. There is notenough about young women."
- For the whole of the population they provide information, but not always about Pacific women."
- 😉 "I have asked for the stats on Maori women of certain ages, in certain areas, their achievements in education, training and work outcomes. I was told to go to Te Puni Kōkir instead.A lot of these stats are plucked from somewhere else or generic."
- Let "I think it is coming back to the fact that I think there is an overlooking of women at the bottom of the heap."

Others believed being a trusted source of knowledge about all women was an unrealistic goal for the Ministry to strive for.

- Lateral are a small dedicated team. They do not try to be all things to all women. They take a more targeted approach."
- (2) "Of course they are not [knowledgeable about all women], no one is able to be."
- 😉 "I think understanding all women in New Zealand seems like such a godlike ability that is beyond a small Ministry to have."
- "Their frame is gender and they are looking at what is happening with women. I do not have any evidence that they differentiate between the 200+ ethnicities "
- \*We are one of the most diverse countries in the OECD and nobody has a full handle on the issues facing women across all of those different communities."
- Let "I don't believe that they have the capacity or capability to be that. I don't think they have regional knowledge. I don't know how much they represent the views of those who are most disadvantaged."

### 5.3 Strengthen Stakeholder Relationships

Stakeholders recognise that the many challenges faced by the Ministry can be directly related to limited resources.

- "The Ministry is absolutely, totally and completely the poor relation in government and it is hamstrung by the lack of budget for their project initiatives."
- \*Resourcing is an enormous issue for them and all the other government departments seem to have far more resources than they have. I think they need to be louder in government. For their brief, they need to raise their flag up the pole a lot higher with regard to women's issues in general."
- "They have the least financial support from the government. How much more could they achieve if given more.
- "We try to work with them, but sometimes you feel that they are limited in what they can do."
- "Because they have got no money, they are always looking for people to pay for things that the government should be paying for. They want employers to pay for things that are really government policy patterns and government issues."
- Let "It is because they are the smallest ministry it is like David and Goliath."
- "Have more people, I think. ... When they have competing priorities, they can only put so much money into things."
- "They need to come to the table with a proper budget for some of the stuff they want to work on, instead of expecting the industry to pay for it"

One of the consequences of the Ministry's limited resources is a high rate of staff turnover and high dependence on staff for relationships with stakeholders. This can lead to complications if contact with a stakeholder is lost or deprioritised when a staff member leaves.

A proactive approach to information sharing and collaboration can develop relationships between the Ministry as an organisation and its stakeholders. By broadening the kind of interaction the Ministry has with its stakeholders, they can strive to develop a relationship as an organisation instead of an individual. This helps to reduce the dependency on individual staff members for relationships with stakeholders, minimising the effects staff turnover may have on the Ministry. Proactive collaboration and communication continues to keep the Ministry as an active partner for stakeholders.

Less change-over in personnel, as working relationships are very important in this area we are working in."

- "We do find it quite difficult to know who to communicate with because they are always changing. [Its] something we have mentioned before and you see it quite often in government. You just get to know somebody and suddenly they have moved off somewhere else. The Ministry is quite bad at it"
- Lateral of women at the Ministry is really high so there is no consistency in people to contact."
- La "Have had CEO changes and it causes disruption. My engagement with them occurs when I contact them or at a function and they are reminded of me. They do not have a structured plan of contact with stakeholders."
- "We have built up a relationship with staff, and that has been ongoing and has not changed in terms of turnover, so we have been able to maintain relationships, which means there has been more connection for our colleagues, including management and non-management."
- Later frequency and for them to be more proactive. We want more interaction, more information generated by them that would help us to fulfil our objectives that we do not have to prompt them to provide."
- Last 5 years I have tried to build a relationship with the Ministry and it has been difficult. I quess change of staff has been an issue. High turnover or high churn has been a bit of an issue to build relationships. But in the last few months we have had more feedback and interaction with the Ministry than we ever have. Not sure what has brought that on, but it has. Otherwise we have been trying to build a real relationship for the last five years and we have been able to build much stronger relationships with other Ministries."
- "We just keep trying to make it work. Poor communication which perhaps comes down to changing staff regularly, and lack of funding... I am sure they are very poorly funded. We just try to get to know the people who are there"
- "The Ministry could commit to an ongoing programme of research looking at aspects of the victimisation of women in New Zealand and maybe consult with us more regularly. Once a month would be nice".



# Perceptions of the Ministry

All stakeholders were asked how much they agreed or disagreed with a variety of statements concerning the Ministry. Answers were measured on a five-point scale where 1=strongly disagree and 5=strongly agree. Overall, the performance of the Ministry is positive. The area that perform least well is 'Works in a timely manner'.

Table 6.1 Perceptions of the Ministry, Main Stakeholders

	Agreement* with statement (%)	Agreement* with statement (Respondents)
Works Collaboratively with you/your organisation	85%	47
Works in a timely manner	75%	41
Has a clear gender frame in its approach	95%	52
Follows through on the things it has committed to you to do	85%	47
Takes an evidence based approach to its work	80%	44
Total	100%	55

 $<sup>{\</sup>rm *Stakeholders\,who\,agreed\,or\,strongly\,agreed\,with\,the\,statement}.$ 

Table 6.2 Perceptions of the Ministry, Education and Training Stakeholders (n=14)

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Works Collaboratively with you/your organisation	0	2	1	1	10
Works in a timely manner	0	1	2	8	3
Has a clear gender frame in its approach	0	0	0	9	5
Follows through on the things it has committed to you to do	0	0	2	2	10
Takes an evidence based approach to its work	0	2	3	8	1

Table 6.3 Perceptions of the Ministry, Growing Skills Stakeholders (n=12)

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Works Collaboratively with you/your organisation	0	1	1	0	10
Works in a timely manner*	0	1	1	7	2
Has a clear gender frame in its approach	0	0	0	7	5
Follows through on the things it has committed to you to do	0	0	3	2	7
Takes an evidence based approach to its work	0	2	2	7	1

<sup>\*</sup>n=11 as one respondent did not answer

Table 6.4 Perceptions of the Ministry, Leadership Stakeholders (n=22)

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Works Collaboratively with you/your organisation	0	0	1	8	13
Works in a timely manner*	0	1	2	10	8
Has a clear gender frame in its approach	0	0	1	7	14
Follows through on the things it has committed to you to do	0	0	2	8	12
Takes an evidence based approach to its work	0	0	1	11	10

<sup>\*</sup>n=21 as one respondent did not answer

#### Table 6.5 Perceptions of the Ministry, Safety from Violence Stakeholders (n=13)

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Works Collaboratively with you/your organisation	0	0	2	5	6
Works in a timely manner	0	0	2	10	1
Has a clear gender frame in its approach	0	0	0	4	9
Follows through on the things it has committed to you to do	0	0	1	7	5
Takes an evidence based approach to its work	0	0	1	4	8

#### Table 6.6 Perceptions of the Ministry, International Stakeholders (n=13)

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Works Collaboratively with you/your organisation	0	1	3	3	6
Works in a timely manner	0	4	0	5	4
Has a clear gender frame in its approach	0	0	2	8	3
Follows through on the things it has committed to you to do	0	1	1	6	5
Takes an evidence based approach to its work	0	1	4	5	3

#### Table 6.7 Perceptions of the Ministry, Nomination Services Stakeholders (n=3)

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Works Collaboratively with you/your organisation	0	0	0	1	2
Works in a timely manner	0	0	0	1	2
Follows through on the things it has committed to you to do	0	0	0	1	2

Table 6.8 Perceptions of the Ministry, NACEW Stakeholders (n=8)

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Works Collaboratively with you/your organisation	0	0	1	1	6
Works in a timely manner*	0	0	0	6	1
Follows through on the things it has committed to you to do	0	0	0	4	4

<sup>\*</sup>n=7 as one respondent did not answer

### 6.1 The Ministry Delivers a Thorough Service

Nomination services and NACEW stakeholders were asked how strongly they agreed or disagreed that the Ministry delivers a thorough service. The question was asked on a five-point scale, where 1=strongly disagree and 5=strongly agree

The Ministry was perceived as providing reliable and timely advice. However, they were also expected to do more to inform stakeholders on the services and opportunities that the Ministry can provide for them.

Table 6.9: Perceptions of the Ministry's Service Delivery

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree	N/A
Nominations (n=3)	0	0	0	1	2	0
NACEW (n=8)	0	0	0	4	3	1
Total	0	0	0	5	5	0

# 6.2 The Ministry gives Good Nominations Advice

Stakeholders who had used the Nominations service were asked to rate how strongly they agreed or disagreed that the Ministry gives clear nominations advice. The question was asked on a five-point scale, where 1=strongly disagree and 5=strongly agree.

Nominations were seen as important in assisting stakeholders in achieving their diversity targets, and 2 of the 3 stakeholders strongly agreed these nominations were clear.

Table 6.10: Perceptions of the Ministry's Nomination Service (n=3)

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Nominations	0	0	1	0	2

# Appendix One: Interview Questionnaires



Stakeholder Feedback Research: Education-Training, Growing

Skills, Leadership, Safety, International

Interview Guide 2017

Good morning/afternoon, my name is <researcher name> and I'm calling from Research First on behalf of the Ministry for Women.

As someone identified as being part of their key stakeholder group, the Ministry for Women wishes to understand your satisfaction with the services the Ministry has provided to you. The survey will take 20-25 minutes depending on how much you have to say.

As we work through this interview, please remember:

- Everything you say will be treated with strict confidence;
- We will never pass on information to the client or any other company, which might identify you personally;
- You can skip over any questions, or withdraw from the survey at any time; and
- With your permission, I'd like to record this call for quality assurance purposes.

Should you have any questions about the research, please phone Ann Thompson, Research Director on 0508 473 7327.

Researcher, note name, role and organisation:

Name:	
Role:	
Organisation:	

#### PART 1: Introduction

1. What kind of organisation are you answering on behalf of? [READ OUT]

A government agency
A Crown agency
A Non-Governmental Organisation (NGO)
Independent
Other (Please specify)

2. In which of the following areas have you worked with or consulted with the Ministry in the last 12 months? [READ OUT, MAY BE MORE THAN ONE]

Education-Training
Growing Skills
Leadership
Safety
International

Please note that at the end of this survey I will ask you some open questions regarding what you think the Ministry does well, and where you think the Ministry could improve.

Page 1 of 6



### $\textbf{Stakeholder Feedback Research:} \ \, \textbf{Education-Training, Growing}$

Skills, Leadership, Safety, International Interview Guide 2017

3. Could you give me a quick overview of how you currently work with the Ministry? (I.e., what service/s does the Ministry provide for you?)
<ul> <li>Why did you work with the Ministry?</li> <li>a. E.g. Overlapping objectives, collaboration means can achieve more than otherwise, MWA are expering the area, MWA focus on women provided leverage, etc.</li> </ul>
5. Please rate the value to your organisation of the work the Ministry is doing/ has done, using the follow scale. Was the Ministry's work
Very valuable
Valuable
Neutral Net valuable
Not valuable  Not at all valuable
6. How does the Ministry add value to the work of your organisation and others?
7. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?



#### Stakeholder Feedback Research: Education-Training, Growing

Skills, Leadership, Safety, International

Interview Guide 2017

your agency was provided with high quality agency has incorporated the Ministry's	For I	<b>International</b> respondents	For all other respondents			
	8.	your agency was provided with high quality and timely information, and was appropriately consulted on the Government's CEDAW report?  Strongly Agree Agree Neutral Disagree	agency has incorporated the Ministry's evidence, analysis and advice into your policie and practices?  Strongly Agree Agree Neutral Disagree Strongly Disagree			

#### **PART**

Please rate how much you agree or disagree with the following statements using a 1 to 5 scale, where  $1 = \frac{1}{2}$  strongly disagree,  $3 = \frac{1}{2}$  neutral and  $5 = \frac{1}{2}$  strongly agree:

The Ministry...

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Has a clear gender frame in its approach					
Takes an evidence based approach to its work					
Works collaboratively with your organisation					
Follows through on the things it has committed to you to do					
Is a trusted source of knowledge about all women in New Zealand**					
Is a trusted source of knowledge about Māori women					
Works in a timely manner					

Page 3 of 6



# $\textbf{Stakeholder Feedback Research:} \ \, \textbf{Education-Training, Growing}$

Skills, Leadership, Safety, International

or dissatisfied you are with	n the quality	y of the M	/linistry's adv	vice:	
	n the quality	y of the M	/linistry's adv	vice:	
	n the quality	y of the M	Ainistry's adv	vice:	
	n the quality	y of the M	Ainistry's adv	vice:	
	n the quality	y of the M	/linistry's adv	vice:	
	n the quality	y of the M	Ainistry's adv	vice:	
	n the quality	y of the M	/linistry's adv	vice:	
	n the quality	y of the M	/linistry's adv	vice:	
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with					
or dissatisfied you are with	a the quality	v of the M	Ainistry's inte	oraction with w	011.
	Title quality	y or the ivi	Annistry's mite	eraction with y	ou.



#### $\textbf{Stakeholder Feedback Research:} \ \textbf{Education-Training, Growing}$

Skills, Leadership, Safety, International Interview Guide 2017

17.	What makes your relationship with the Ministry work, or not work, to your expectations?
18.	How could the Ministry improve their relationship with you?
	non codia die ministry improve dien relationship man you.
19.	Do you think the Ministry is aware of the wider context of the work you are doing?
20.	If not, what could the Ministry do to become more aware?
1	



#### Stakeholder Feedback Research: Education-Training, Growing

		Skills, Leadership, Safety, International Interview Guide 2017	
	21.	Where is the Ministry for Women currently adding value to you/your organisation?	
		t Comments	
Thinki	ng abo	out the Ministry for Women in general  What do you think the Ministry does well and should do more of?	
	23.	Where could the Ministry make improvements?	
		Thank you for your participation.	
		Page 6 of 6	
		. 450 0 0. 0	



#### Stakeholder Feedback Research: NACEW

**Interview Guide 2017** 

Good morning/afternoon, my name is <researcher name> and I'm calling from Research First on behalf of the Ministry for Women.

As someone identified as being part of their key stakeholder group, the Ministry for Women wishes to understand your satisfaction with the services the Ministry has provided to you. The survey will take 20-25 minutes depending on how much you have to say.

As we work through this interview, please remember:

- Everything you say will be treated with strict confidence;
- We will never pass on information to the client or any other company, which might identify you personally;
- You can skip over any questions, or withdraw from the survey at any time; and
- With your permission, I'd like to record this call for quality assurance purposes.

Should you have any questions about the research, please phone Ann Thompson, Research Director on 0508 473 7327.

Researcher, note name, role and organisation:

Name:	
Role:	
Organisation:	

#### PART 1: Introduction

1.	Could you give me a quick overview of how you currently work with the Ministry? (I.e., what service/s
	does the Ministry provide for you?)

#### PART 2: Perceptions of the Ministry

Please rate how much you agree or disagree with the following statements using a 1 to 5 scale, where 1 = strongly disagree, 3 = neutral and 5 = strongly agree:

The Ministry...

	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Works collaboratively with you	1	2	3	4	5
Follows through on the things it has committed to you to do	1	2	3	4	5
Works in a timely manner	1	2	3	4	5
Delivers a thorough service	1	2	3	4	5

Page 1 of 2



мinistry	for <b>Women</b> Stakeholder Feedback Research: NACEW  Interview Guide 2017
3.	Please rate how satisfied or dissatisfied you are with the quality of the Ministry's advice and support for the National Advisory Council on the Employment of Women during the transition process? [READ OUT SCALE]    Excellent   More than met requirements   Met requirements   Partly met requirements   Did not meet requirements
4.	Why/ Why not?
5.	Where is the Ministry for Women currently adding value to you/your organisation?
	Thank you for your participation.
	Page 2 of 2



# Stakeholder Feedback Research: Nominations Service Interview Guide, 2017

Good morning/afternoon, my name is <researcher name> and I'm calling from Research First on behalf of the Ministry for Women.

As someone identified as being part of their key stakeholder group, the Ministry for Women wishes to understand your satisfaction with the services the Ministry has provided to you. The survey will take 20-25 minutes depending on how much you have to say.

As we work through this interview, please remember:

- Everything you say will be treated with strict confidence;
- We will never pass on information to the client or any other company, which might identify you personally;
- You can skip over any questions, or withdraw from the survey at any time; and
- With your permission, I'd like to record this call for quality assurance purposes.

Should you have any questions about the research, please phone Ann Thompson, Research Director on 0508 473 7327.

Researcher, note name, role and organisation:

Name:	
Role:	
Organisation:	

Please note that at the end of this survey I will ask you some open questions regarding what you think the Ministry does well, and where you think the Ministry could improve.

#### PART 1: The Work You Have Done with the Ministry

1.	Could you give me a quick overview of how you currently work with the Ministry? (I.e., what service/s does the Ministry provide for you?)
2.	Why do you work with the Ministry?  a. E.g. Overlapping objectives, collaboration means can achieve more than otherwise, MWA are experts in the area, MWA focus on women provided leverage, etc.

Page 1 of 4



#### Stakeholder Feedback Research: Nominations Service Interview Guide, 2017

3. Where is the Ministry for Women currently adding value to you/your organisation?
4. Please rate the value to your organisation of the work the Ministry is doing/ has done, using the following scale. Was the Ministry's work
Very valuable
Valuable Neutral
Not valuable
Not at all valuable
6. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?
6. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?
6. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?
6. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?
6. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?
6. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?
6. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?
6. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?
6. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?
6. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?
6. What could the Ministry have done/ do differently to provide more value to your organisation?



#### Stakeholder Feedback Research: Nominations Service Interview Guide, 2017

The Ministry					
	Strongly Disagree	Disagree	Neutral	Agree	Strongly Agree
Gives clear nominations advice					
Norks collaboratively with your					
organisation Follows through on the things it has committed to you to do					
Norks in a timely manner					
Delivers a thorough service					
9. Why/ Why not?					
ART 3: Your Relationship with the Minist	ry				
	p with the Minist	ry work, or no	t work, to you	ır expectatio	ns?
10. What makes your relationshi					7



# Ministry for **Women** Stakeholder Feedback Research: Nominations Service

- )	ที่ winitetanga min กลุฮ					
11.	How could the Ministry improve their relationship with you?					
	out the Ministry for Women in general					
12.	What do you think the Ministry does well and should do more of?					
13.	Where could the Ministry improve its services?					
Thank you for your participation.						
Page 4 of 4						



#### **CHRISTCHURCH OFFICE**

23 Carlyle Street PO Box 94 Christchurch 8140 Tel: 03 281 7832

#### **OTAGO OFFICE**

28 Helwick Street Wanaka 9305 Tel: 022 676 8722

#### **WELLINGTON OFFICE**

Level 12, 215-229 Lambton Quay Wellington 6140

#### **TAURANGA OFFICE**

PO Box 4632 Mt Maunganui 3141 Tel: 021 0269 2354

#### **AUCKLAND OFFICE**

Unit 3, Level 1 Qb Studios 208 Ponsonby Road Auckland 1011