

# Speak Up, Seek Help, Safe Home

A review of literature on culturally appropriate interventions for intimate partner violence in ethnic communities

# **Table of Contents**

Key findings	1
Introduction	1
The project	1
Ethnic communities: the New Zealand context	2
The literature review	3
Scope	3
Summary of findings	3
Conclusion	4
Summary of literature reviewed	5
Services for victims	5
Treatment for offenders	8
Prevention	9
Appendix A1	1
Tables on ethnicity and intimate partner violence	1
Table 1: Total convicted offenders on the charge of male assaults female by ethnicity, 2008 1	1
Table 2: Apprehensions by ethnicity, 2009	1
Table 3: Couple-related homicide perpetrators and victims, 2002-2006	1
Table 4: Applicants and respondents for protection orders by ethnicity, 2006	2
Table 5: Ethnic makeup of New Zealand, 2006 Census	2
Table 6: Asians as a percentage of the New Zealand population, 2006 Census	2
Appendix B13	3
Texts surveyed13	3

# **Key findings**

- There is very little New Zealand research on culturally appropriate interventions for intimate partner violence in ethnic communities.
- The research generally lacks evaluation.
- Most research deals with services for victims or prevention; little deals with treatment for offenders.
- The most promising interventions involved engaging victims and offenders in specialised concurrent therapy groups that consider clients' broad social contexts, although evaluation for effectiveness and safety is lacking.\*
- The suggestions for making services for victims more culturally appropriate/reaching ethnic communities broadly aligned with the themes arising from MWA's and OEA's own community consultations.

### Introduction

# The project

The Ministry of Women's Affairs (MWA) has, in collaboration with the Office of Ethnic Affairs (OEA), commenced a project on the nature and prevalence of intimate partner violence in ethnic communities in New Zealand. ('Ethnic', for the purposes of this project, is defined as those people who identify with an ethnic group that is not Pākehā, Māori or Pacific.) Our aim is to gain a sound understanding of culturally appropriate interventions for intimate partner violence within ethnic communities in order to provide evidence-based policy advice for reducing its incidence and impact.

The need to understand and develop good practice in family violence prevention and intervention for certain groups, including ethnic communities, was identified as an area of need by the Taskforce for Action on Violence within Families (TAVF) as part of its work programme, although this work has not been progressed due to changing priorities and lack of capacity. In acknowledgement of this identified need, one of the deliverables of our project is a literature review of current research on culturally appropriate interventions for intimate partner violence in ethnic communities. It is intended that this literature review will inform the direction of the project's future work stream, as well as providing a resource for agencies working in the field of intimate partner violence towards ethnic women.

<sup>\*</sup> The information contained in this literature review is up-to-date as at July 2010. A minor correction was made to the wording of the key findings on this page in November 2010.

2

#### **Ethnic communities: the New Zealand context**

New Zealand's ethnic makeup has changed dramatically in the last 25 years. In 1986 1.5 percent of the population identified as Asian, and all other ethnic people made up 0.3 percent of the population. By the 2006 Census, those identifying as Asian made up 9.2 percent of the population, with 3.6 percent identifying as Chinese, 2.7 percent identifying as Indian (including Fijian Indian) and 0.9 percent of the population identified as Middle Eastern, Latin American or African. That year, 22.9 percent of residents were born overseas, and China was the second most common overseas birthplace after England.<sup>2</sup>

Despite growing numbers of ethnic migrants, data on the prevalence of intimate partner violence in ethnic communities is scarce (see Appendix A for full data on ethnicity and violence in New Zealand). Ministry of Justice figures show that in 2008 3.5 percent of all 'male assaults female' convictions – a conviction commonly awarded in domestic violence cases – were awarded to offenders of the 'Other' ethnic group.<sup>3</sup> Likewise, police statistics record that, in 2009, suspects apprehended on the charge of 'male assaults female' were Asiatic in 1.8 percent of cases, Indian in 3.5 percent of cases and 'Other' ethnic in 1.2 percent of cases.<sup>4</sup> Ministry of Justice figures also record that in 2006, 8.5 percent of applicants for protection orders, and 8.3 percent of respondents, belonged to the 'Other' ethnic group.<sup>5</sup>

Perhaps of most concern are the family homicide figures for 2002 to 2006. While the overall figures are small and should be interpreted with caution, Asian victims and perpetrators of couple-related homicides made up 16.9 percent of victims overall and 12.7 percent of perpetrators. Moreover, despite nearly 25 percent of Asian people being New Zealand-born, only two out of the 20 Asian or Pacific perpetrators (the figures for place of birth are not broken down into Asian only) and two out of the 23 Asian or Pacific victims were born in New Zealand. Asian victims of couple-related homicide were also predominantly under 25 years of age, significantly younger than victims of other ethnicities.

Because only a small number of domestic violence incidents are brought to police attention, these figures probably significantly under-estimate the prevalence of intimate partner violence in ethnic communities. For example, in 2005 four percent, or one in every 25, of all females surveyed in the *New Zealand Crime and Safety Survey 2006* reported being the victim of assault one or more times by a partner. The same year, however, only 7175 apprehensions for male assaults female in total were laid, or approximately one apprehension per 570 people.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> 1996 Census of Population and Dwellings, Statistics New Zealand.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> 2006 Census of Population and Dwellings, Statistics New Zealand.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Statistics New Zealand website, Conviction and Sentencing Tables.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Statistics New Zealand website, Conviction and Sentencing Tables.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Families Commission (2009), *Family Violence Statistics Report.* Wellington: Families Commission.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>6</sup> Martin, Jennifer and Pritchard, Rhonda (2010), *Learning from Tragedy: Homicide within Families in New Zealand, 2002-2006.* Wellington: Ministry of Social Development.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>7</sup> Families Commission (2009), Family Violence Statistics Report.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>8</sup> Statistics New Zealand Website, Conviction and Sentencing Tables.

3

Published research on domestic violence in ethnic communities in New Zealand, as well as anecdotal evidence from MWA's and OEA's own community consultations, suggest that ethnic women may face additional barriers to reporting or seeking help for domestic violence compared with Pākehā or Māori women. Moreover, many of the countries of origin of ethnic people in New Zealand are reported to have high levels of domestic violence. The WHO Multi-Country Study on Women's Health and Domestic Violence Against Women (2005), for example, states that of all ever-married women surveyed in Dhaka and Matlab (Bangladesh), 53 percent and 62 percent respectively had experienced some form of physical or sexual violence by a partner during their lifetimes. In the same study, the lifetime prevalence of physical or sexual partner violence against women from Ethiopia and Namibia was reported at 71 percent and 36 percent respectively and, in Thailand, the figures were 41 percent in Bangkok and 47 percent in Nakhonsawan. We recognise, however, that the ethnic community in New Zealand is diverse, and the scope of intimate partner violence in these communities has yet to be determined accurately.

### The literature review

## Scope

The focus of this literature review is on culturally appropriate interventions for domestic violence in ethnic communities, encompassing prevention, services for victims and treatment for offenders. Research on interventions for domestic violence in ethnic communities in New Zealand is scarce. For that reason, the majority of this research is based in the United States, Canada and Australia.

In order to make the review manageable and relevant, it has been limited as far as possible to those ethnic groups that are significantly represented in New Zealand. Thus while, for example, a good deal of research in the United States deals with violence in Latino communities, we did not judge this to be a priority for this review. Nonetheless, because many of the findings from the research are generally applicable to ethnic minorities, the research presented here is also likely to benefit very small ethnic communities within New Zealand.

# **Summary of findings**

There is a large body of research in the field of intimate partner violence in ethnic communities. Of the research that specifically examines intervention, most attends to services for victims; a smaller amount attends to prevention; and even less attends to treatment for offenders. The predominant methodology used in the literature reviewed was that of surveying the experiences of community members, clients and workers, and soliciting their suggestions.

<sup>9</sup> Tse, Samson (2007), 'Family Violence in Asian Communities: Combining Research and Community Development.'

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>10</sup> As a comparison, the same study reported the lifetime prevalence of physical or sexual partner violence in New Zealand as 34 percent in Auckland and 42 percent in North Waikato.

The themes emerging from this research – e.g. community dislike of direct reference to violence, the need to work with community leaders and the lack of appropriate language support in services – aligned with the themes that arose from the community consultations carried out by MWA and OEA. The most developed area of research was that which offered suggestions to workers for developing a more culturally sensitive approach; these suggestions applied broadly to different ethnicities and cultures. The most promising literature on treatment for offenders (and, to a large extent, victims) described therapy that involved both partners and considered clients' broader social contexts (see in particular the descriptions of the Cultural Context Model (CCM) and Cervantes and Cervantes).

The lack of evaluative material on domestic violence interventions was problematic. Only two papers – Jurak's and Ziaian's reports on intervention projects carried out in Perth and New South Wales respectively – contained significant evaluation. In both these projects, participants were surveyed; both projects reported positive feedback about factors such as knowledge of services, willingness to access services, awareness about violence issues and willingness to talk about violence. Little other evaluation is evident in the literature. This is true of even the most developed of intervention programmes, such as the CCM. Cervantes and Cervantes provide some evaluation of the effect of counselling from a multicultural perspective, but because only two case studies are cited, the evaluative power is limited.

#### Conclusion

Overall, this review uncovered a need for further research on culturally appropriate interventions for intimate partner violence in ethnic communities, particularly in the areas of evaluation and working with offenders in culturally appropriate ways. Given the enormous diversity of the ethnic community, it is perhaps unsurprising that there should be gaps in the literature, although it should be noted that many of the recommendations in the reviewed literature were applicable to ethnic communities generally. Nonetheless, the surveyed literature draws upon considerable collective experience in the field of social services, and many of its recommendations are still likely to be useful for mainstream agencies attempting to make their services more culturally appropriate for ethnic clients. Because the ability of many services to respond to ethnic clients in culturally appropriate ways is currently limited, the more basic, practical suggestions emerging from the review are likely to be particularly useful. There is also some scope for agencies and workers who wish to attempt more extensive approaches to rendering mainstream services culturally appropriate, such as utilising therapeutic models like the CCM or reshaping agency policy. Either way, the need to adapt social services to the needs of ethnic residents is likely to become increasingly urgent as New Zealand's ethnic makeup continues to change.

# Summary of literature reviewed

#### Services for victims

Services for victims comprised the largest portion of the literature reviewed. Many articles suggested practical ways in which mainstream services can better suit the needs of ethnic women, such as ensuring language accessibility and access to a broad range of services, and providing same language support groups. A good deal of advice was aimed at educating workers about appropriate multicultural approaches for workers. Although some of the material was culture-specific (e.g. Keller and Brennan's suggestion that gender-matching police officers with Sudanese victims is appropriate), most of it was broadly applicable to a wide range of cultures.

The literature around services for victims can be grouped into the following broad categories.

#### Language accessibility

The need to ensure language accessibility was a persistent theme in the literature. Several authors recommended employing bilingual or ethnic workers (Bagshaw et al.; Bhuyan and Senturia; Grewel; Huisman; MacLeod and Shin; Sharma; Pan et al; Ziaian); others emphasised the need to provide culturally competent translators (Bagshaw et al., the Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Australia) and Tse). On a more specific level, Keller and Brennan and Tse point out that gender-matching interpreters may be important.

An example of a model of communication called the Multilingual Access Model, in which bilingual women from the community are recruited as paid on-call language advocates, is described by Makara et al.

#### Culturally sensitive approaches for workers and/or services

Suggestions for ways for workers and agencies to develop culturally sensitive approaches were both numerous and, generally, broadly applicable to ethnic communities. Some authors critiqued attempts to treat clients in a 'colour-blind' way, arguing that it obscures clients' experiences of racism (Agnew; Cervantes and Cervantes). Many more articles emphasised the need for workers such as counsellors to take into account the broad social context of victims or offenders, including not just culture, but diverse factors like social class, age, gender, experience of racism, family structure, immigration pressures and previous trauma such as torture (Agnew; Cervantes and Cervantes; Coker; Gilmore and Gonzalez; Rees and Pease; Sharma).

A notable example of this approach is the CCM, a method of treatment for domestic violence victims and offenders that was developed in the United States (see Almeida and Dolan-Delvicchio; Almeida and Durkin; and Almeida and Lockard). The CCM is a form of group therapy, in which victims and offenders are treated simultaneously. Influenced by intersectionality theory, the creators of the CCM argue that domestic violence intervention in ethnic communities must take into account the way in which the intersection of gender, race, class, culture and sexual orientation affect perpetrators and victims of violence. A substantial part of the therapy in this model consequently involves exploring and challenging the ways in which power in society is structured around these categories.

Numerous authors emphasised the need for workers to be aware of cultural issues and the pressures faced by immigrants (e.g. Cervantes and Cervantes; Sharma; the Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Australia)). Recommendations included:

- training workers in the specific cultural and political issues affecting migrant victims of domestic violence (Bhuyan and Senturia)
- training child welfare workers in the cultural differences of immigrant families (Bhuyan and Senturia)
- giving training in culturally responsive practice (Crichton-Hill)
- instituting mandatory anti-racism training for workers (Huisman).

Some authors argued that clients should be allowed to maintain traditional values:

- Agnew and Cervantes and Cervantes respectively suggest that traditional cultural values can be mobilised to combat abuse
- Rees and Pease advise workers to promote gender equality while allowing clients to maintain their culture.

A number of articles also emphasised the importance of workers being aware of their own assumptions and cultural background (Cervantes and Cervantes; Crichton-Hill; Gilmore and Gonzalez).

Agnew suggested that services should avoid direct reference to domestic violence; Huisman, however, acknowledges that this approach has the potential of minimising abuse and reinforcing patriarchal structures.

Finally, a number of authors suggested ways in which services could be made more culturally sensitive, such as providing ethnic food at shelters (Huisman); offering flexible hours (Agnew); and including a respected family member in therapy where appropriate (Cervantes and Cervantes). In their study of domestic violence in the Sudanese community in Nebraska, Keller and Brennan cite anecdotal evidence from

police that gender-matching police officers with victims and/or offenders is appropriate.

### Support groups for women

Some authors proposed same language support groups as a way of helping ethnic victims of domestic violence (Bhuyan and Senturia; MacLeod and Shin). Agnew suggests topics for support group discussions that include teaching about power relations, including racism and non-violent conflict resolution. Ziaian describes an Australian project, funded by the South Australian Health Commission, where multicultural support groups for domestic violence victims were formed.

### Agency policy

Unsurprisingly, several authors argued that mainstream agencies should ensure that their policies do not discriminate against ethnic women (Bhuyan and Senturia; Crichton-Hill; Gilmore and Gonzalez). More radically, both Coker and Smith insist that the greater vulnerability of ethnic women means that their needs should be placed at the *centre* of mainstream domestic violence policies in the United States. Coker, for example, argues that the ability of the most vulnerable women in society – that is, those most 'dramatically affected by inequalities of gender, race, and class' (p. 370) – to access material resources should be the priority of all domestic violence strategies. This strategy, Coker argues, rectifies a number of problems that current policies present ethnic women in particular, such as failure to consider how policies that encourage women to leave perpetrators put poor women (who are often also ethnic women) in more danger, because they may lack the resources to leave or hide. Likewise, both Coker and Smith argue that domestic violence policies need to consider how the risk of state violence against ethnic women, such as police brutality or the threat of deportation, affects their ability to seek help.

#### General services

A number of articles mention general services that have been identified as areas of need for ethnic victims of domestic violence. These include assistance with:

- employment (Bhuyan and Senturia; MacLeod and Shin; Pan et al.)
- childcare (Bhuyan and Senturia; MacLeod and Shin)
- English language (MacLeod and Shin; Rees and Pease)
- housing (Bhuyan and Senturia; MacLeod and Shin; Simbandumwe et al.).

#### Forming networks with other agencies and co-ordinating services

The need to co-ordinate services and form alliances with other agencies (including social, legal and health service providers and ethnic agencies/community groups)

was emphasised by several authors (Preisser; Simbandumwe et al.; Bhuyan and Senturia; Gilmore and Gonzalez; Huisman; MacLeod and Shin).

Pateras briefly describes attempts by the Women's Liberation Halfway House, a refuge for non-English speaking women in Melbourne, to forge community networks. Bhattacharjee suggests aligning the domestic violence movement with other activist movements.

#### Treatment for offenders

Treatment for offenders comprised a relatively small portion of the literature reviewed. The fullest accounts were the guide to working with men and relationships published by the Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Australia), which includes a section on working with ethnic men; Wah's article on anger management; and the articles dealing with the Cultural Context Model. More broadly, many of the issues raised under the umbrella of services for victims were also applied to offenders as well.

### Language accessibility

The Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Australia) pointed out the importance of assessing language ability and working with culturally competent interpreters.

#### Culturally sensitive approaches for workers and/or services

Many of the approaches discussed in the section attending to victims' services were also aimed at workers working with offenders.

- The multicultural approach that takes into account clients' broad social context endorsed by Cervantes and Cervantes, Rees and Pease and the authors of the CCM (see above) applies in the papers in question to offenders as well as victims. A similar approach is suggested in the guide published by the Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Australia), which encourages workers to take into account factors like individual family differences, migration stresses, torture and trauma, and experiences of racism.
- The argument made by Cervantes and Cervantes and Crichton-Hall that workers should be aware of their own cultural biases (see above) is applied to workers working with both victims and offenders. A similar argument is also made by the Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Australia).
- Cervantes and Cervantes' and Rees and Pease's arguments that clients should be allowed to maintain traditional values are applied to workers working with both

victims and offenders. This is also true of Cervantes and Cervantes' suggestion that belief in or affirmation of a client's cultural background may be useful.

 As discussed above, the CCM is a programme aimed jointly at victims and offenders.

The Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Australia) describes additional effective ways of engaging with ethnic offenders, which are illustrated by case studies. These include conveying the message that clients' cultures are neither intrinsically good nor bad, and adopting a position of 'informed not-knowing', whereby the worker 'values both professional expertise as well as uncertainty' (p. 60).

#### Support groups and mentors for men

Both the Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Australia) and the authors of the articles about the CCM emphasise the importance of male offenders having male mentors who facilitate the exploration of alternative, non-violent models of masculinity. Another article by Wah describes a man's group that assists Asian men with anger management; this group explores issues relating to racism, culture and paternal relationships.

#### Prevention

Prevention comprised a significant portion of the literature surveyed. Community engagement in prevention initiatives was particularly strongly encouraged, although there was some critique of this model (Smith). Appropriate methods of reaching ethnic communities were also discussed by a number of authors.

#### Community engagement

The need to involve communities in domestic violence prevention initiatives was a dominant theme in the literature (Bhuyan and Senturia; Coker; Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Australia); MacLeod and Shin; Masaki, Kim and Chung; Pan et al.; Preisser; Rees and Pease; Smith; Tse).

Some authors emphasised the need to work with community and religious leaders (Bagshaw et al.; Simbandumwe et al.; Ziaian).

Several authors emphasised the advantages of the collective, rather than individualistic, nature of the community-based approach (Almeida and Lockard; Bhattacharjee; Smith).

Jurak; Kennedy, Clarke and Yong; Simbandumwe et al.; and Venkatraman and Johar describe examples of community-based domestic violence projects.

Smith outlines some of the shortcomings of the community involvement model, such as the potential for the community to side with the offender or compromise victim safety. Smith also recommends expanding the definition of 'community' beyond geography, to include communities such as religious or professional communities.

### Effective methods of reaching ethnic communities

A number of authors gave suggestions for ways of reaching ethnic communities effectively. These included:

- Targeting information at places where ethnic people are likely to see it, e.g. several authors recommend using ethnic media to educate ethnic communities about domestic violence and available services (Bagshaw et al.; Bhuyan and Senturia; Simbandumwe et al.), and Huisman advises leaving reading material in places where ethnic people go. Simbandumwe et al. advise integrating information about domestic violence into other programmes that interest ethnic people, and Keller and Brennan suggest utilising prenatal care services as a means for making contact. A number of authors also suggest networking as a useful way to reach ethnic women and communities (Bhuyan and Senturia; Huisman; Simbandumwe et al.; Ziaian).
- Targeting illiterate women through radio broadcasts (Bhuyan and Senturia) or material with pictures or simple words (Keller and Brennan).
- Giving migrants information early in the immigration process (Bagshaw et al.; Sharma; Simbandumwe et al.) and educating refugees about English language and the culture of the host country (Rees and Pease).
- Using outreach programmes for youth (Bhuyan and Senturia and Simbandumwe et al.) or alternative outreach programmes such as theatre (Sharma and MacLeod and Shin).

Several authors suggested that services should avoid direct reference to domestic violence (Pan et al.). Some authors encourage workers to emphasise positive family relationships (Simbandumwe et al.; see Jurak and Venkatraman and Johar for descriptions of culturally sensitive approaches to domestic violence prevention that emphasise concepts like family harmony).

### Parenting programmes

Two articles also suggested that parenting programmes that advocate general values of non-violence could be useful for tackling domestic violence (Pan et al.; Simbandumwe et al.).

# Appendix A

# Tables on ethnicity and intimate partner violence

Table 1: Total convicted offenders on the charge of male assaults female by ethnicity, 2008 (source: Statistics New Zealand)

	European	Māori	Pacific peoples	Other	Unknown/ corporation	Total
No.	786	1410	416	98	83	2793
%	28.1	50.5	14.9	3.5	3.0	

Table 2: Apprehensions by ethnicity, 2009 (source: Statistics New Zealand)

		Caucasian	Māori	Pacific Isle	Indian	Asiatic	Other	Unknown	Total
Male assaults	No.	2785	4122	1269	306	162	105	44	8793
female	%	31.7	46.9	14.4	3.5	1.8	1.2	0.5	
Family offences <sup>11</sup>	No.	1976	2378	477	89	36	65	24	5045
onences	%	39.2	47.1	9.5	1.8	0.7	1.3	0.5	

Table 3: Couple-related homicide perpetrators and victims, 2002-2006 (source: Ministry of Social Development 2010, *Learning from Tragedy: Homicide within Families in New Zealand 2002-2006*)

		NZ European	Māori	Pacific peoples	Asian	Not known	Total
Victims	No.	28	26	10	13	0	77
	%	36.4	33.8	13.0	16.9	0	
Perpetrators	No.	33	22	11	10	3	79
	%	41.8	27.8	13.9	12.7	3.8	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>11</sup> Family violence charges do not include the charge of male assaults female.

Table 4: Applicants and respondents for protection orders by ethnicity, 2006 (source: Families Commission 2009, *Family Violence Statistics Report*)

		NZ European	Māori	Pacific peoples	Other	Unknown	Total
Applicants	No.	2041	1026	233	369	672	4341
	%	47.0	23.6	5.4	8.5	15.5	
Respondents	No.	1789	1100	283	362	804	4338
	%	41.2	25.4	6.5	8.3	18.5	

Table 5: Ethnic makeup of New Zealand, 2006 Census<sup>12</sup> (source: Statistics New Zealand)

European	Māori	Pacific peoples	Asian	Middle Eastern, Latin American and African	New Zealander <sup>13</sup>	Other
67.6%	14.6%	6.9%	9.2%	0.9%	11.1%	<0.1%

Table 6: Asians as a percentage of the New Zealand population, 2006 Census<sup>14</sup> (source: Statistics New Zealand)

Chinese	Indian <sup>15</sup>	Korean	All other Asian	
3.6%	2.7%	0.8%	2.2%	

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>12</sup> These figures exclude responses marked as Don't Know, Refused to Answer, Response Unidentifiable, Response Outside Scope and Not Stated. Respondents may be counted in more than one category.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>13</sup> Of those who identified themselves as New Zealanders in the 2006 Census, 13 percent also identified with at least one other ethnic group. The category "New Zealander" was counted in the "European" category in censuses from 2001 and earlier.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>14</sup> These figures exclude responses marked as Don't Know, Refused to Answer, Response Unidentifiable, Response Outside Scope and Not Stated. Respondents may have been counted in more than one category.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>15</sup> This figure includes the categories Indian (not further defined) and Fijian Indian.

# **Appendix B**

## **Texts surveyed**

Agnew, Vijay (1998) *In Search of a Safe Place: abused women and culturally sensitive services.* Toronto: U of Toronto P.

Location: Canada.

Targeted ethnicity: Asian, African and Caribbean.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** feminist; utilises both reports and studies prepared by community-based groups working with abused immigrant women and fieldwork/interviews with community-based groups, counsellors, staff and administrators.

**Summary:** a general study of services in Canada for battered immigrants from Asia, Africa and the Caribbean. Includes some general suggestions for culturally appropriate services for battered women from these regions.

Almeida, Rhea V. and Dolan-Delvecchio, Ken (1999) 'Addressing Culture in Batterers Intervention: the Asian Indian community as an illustrative example'. *Violence Against Women*, 5(6): pp. 654-83.

Location: United States.

Targeted ethnicity: East Indian immigrants.

Category: services for victims/treatment for offenders.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** the Cultural Context Model (CCM), which was developed at the Institute for Family Services in New Jersey.

**Summary:** gives an overview of East Indian immigration, culture and family structure as it relates to family violence. The rest of the article describes the Cultural Context Model (see Almeida and Durkin) and describes its use amongst East Indian clients.

Almeida, R. V. and Durkin, T. (1999) 'The Cultural Context Model: therapy for couples with domestic violence'. *Journal of Marital and Family Therapy*, 25(3): pp. 313-24.

**Location:** United States.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

**Category:** services for victims/treatment for offenders.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** intersectionality theory and the Cultural Context Model.

**Summary:** a description of the Cultural Context Model, a form of group therapy in which power relations of class, race, gender, and sexual orientation are explored and challenged. Male clients are paired with male mentors, who assist them in exploring new models of masculinity. The article also discusses aspects of 12-step substance abuse programmes that are problematic for domestic violence programmes.

Almeida, Rhea V. and Lockard, Judith (2005) 'The Cultural Context Model: a new paradigm for accountability, empowerment, and the development of critical consciousness against domestic violence', in Natalie J. Sokoloff (Ed), *Domestic Violence at the Margins: readings on race, class, gender, and culture.* New Brunswick: Rutgers UP.

**Location:** United States.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

**Category:** services for victims/treatment for offenders.

Methodology and/or theoretical perspective: the Cultural Context Model.

**Summary:** a description of the Cultural Context Model, as outlined in Almeida and Dolan-Delvicchio. Also describes the role of 'cultural consultants,' who are brought in to challenge the idea that culture and/or religion support patriarchal attitudes.

Bagshaw, D et al. (2000) Reshaping Responses to Domestic Violence. Report for Partnerships Against Domestic Violence, University of South Australia.

Location: Australia.

**Targeted ethnicity:** includes a section on non-English speaking victims.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** the researchers collected qualitative data about the needs of victims of domestic violence in South Australia through phone-ins, focus groups, interviews with service providers and networking. Numbers of migrant call-ins were small, so the researchers also interviewed service providers with experience in the migrant community.

**Summary:** the section of the report on non-English speaking victims of domestic violence identifies a number of service needs for such victims.

Bhattacharjee, A. (1997) 'A Slippery Path: organizing resistance to violence against women', in S. Shah (Ed), *Dragon Ladies: Asian American feminists breathe fire*. Boston: South End.

Location: United States.

Targeted ethnicity: South Asian.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** the author draws upon her personal involvement in Sakhi, a domestic violence organisation for South Asians in New York.

**Summary:** describes the work and philosophies of Sakhi and advocates collective strategies of violence intervention.

Bhuyan, R. and Senturia, K. (2005) 'Understanding Domestic Violence Resource Utilization and Survivor Solutions Among Immigrant and Refugee Women: introduction to the special issue'. *Journal of Interpersonal Violence*, 20: pp. 895-901.

Location: United States

**Targeted ethnicity:** African American, American Indian/Alaskan Native, Ethiopian, Cambodian, Filipina, Latina, Russian-speaking and Vietnamese.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** conducted community-based participatory action research amongst refugee and immigrant communities in Seattle, Washington.

**Summary:** summarises the recommendations arising from the other articles in the special edition of the journal. Makes recommendations for improving domestic violence interventions in the ethnic community at the systems, services and community levels.

Cervantes, N. and Cervantes J. (1993) 'A Multicultural Perspective in the Treatment of Domestic Violence', in M. Hansen and M. Harway (Eds), *Battering and Family Therapy: a feminist perspective*. Newbury Park, CA: Sage.

Location: United States.

Targeted ethnicity: African American, Asian, Native American and Hispanic.

Category: services for victims/treatment for offenders.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** multiculturalist and feminist; uses case studies to illustrate multicultural counselling in action.

**Summary:** discusses multiculturalism as it relates to counselling and feminism and summarises the cultural values of African Americans, Asians, Native Americans and Hispanics. Gives recommendations for counsellors working with ethnic victims and perpetrators of domestic violence.

Coker, Donna (2005). 'Shifting Power for Battered Women: law, material resources, and poor women of color', in Natalie J. Sokoloff (Ed), *Domestic Violence at the Margins: readings on race, class, gender, and culture.* New Brunswick: Rutgers UP.

Location: United States.

**Targeted ethnicity:** uses Latinas as a way of assessing services for all minority women.

Category: services for victims.

Methodology and/or theoretical perspective: LatCrit Theory.

**Summary:** proposes a test called the 'material resources test', which involves rectifying inequalities faced by poor, non-white women by placing their need to access material resources at the centre of domestic violence interventions. Examines the risks that these women face under current policies and suggests some alternative approaches.

Crichton-Hill, Yvonne (2007) 'Family Violence and Cultural Context'. Social Work Now, September: pp. 12-6.

Location: New Zealand.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

Category: services for victims/treatment for offenders.

Methodology and/or theoretical perspective: emphasis on cultural responsiveness.

**Summary:** examines cultural responsiveness at the practitioner, agency and community levels and gives suggestions on incorporating it at each level.

Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs (Australia) (2009). *Introduction to Working with Men and Family Relationships Guide*. Department of Families, Housing, Community Services and Indigenous Affairs.

Location: Australia.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

Category: treatment for offenders.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** article is based on the authors' personal experience as therapists and contains case studies. Advocates an 'informed not-knowing' approach for working with ethnic men.

**Summary:** this broader guide to working with men includes a section on working with cultural minorities in a culturally sensitive way.

Gilmore, Kate and Gonzalez, Mirta (1992) Desperately Seeking Justice: a resource and training manual on violence against women in a culturally diverse community.

Melbourne: CASA House.

**Location:** Australia.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** based on a model developed by Barbara Ferguson in which violence against women is understood within a 'multi-layered context' that consists of 'the universal, the cultural and the individual' (p. 10).

**Summary:** a manual that is aimed at workers and/or services working with ethnic victims of domestic violence. The manual has six steps and provides exercises for workshops for training workers based around these steps.

Grewel, Mandeep (2007) 'A Communicative Perspective on Assisting Battered Asian Indian Immigrant Women', in Shamita Das Dasgupta (Ed), *Body Evidence: intimate partner violence against South Asian women in America*. New Brunswick: Rutgers UP.

**Location:** United States.

Targeted ethnicity: East Indian.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** research is based on two one-hour, face-to-face interviews followed by telephone questionnaires with 15 women in Detroit, Michigan and New Jersey; and telephone interviews with ten women in New Jersey, Connecticut, Illinois, Pennsylvania and New York. Participants were all born in India and had experienced domestic violence by an East Indian male partner.

**Summary:** examines how culturally specific communication patterns act as a barrier to Indian women's access to domestic violence services and gives some suggestions to assist workers in communicating with them.

Huisman, Kimberley A. (1996) 'Wife Battering in Asian American Communities: identifying the service needs of an overlooked segment of the U.S. population'. *Violence Against Women*, 2(3): pp. 260-83.

Location: United States.

Targeted ethnicity: Asian.

**Category:** services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** feminist; interviewed 18 workers working with battered Asian women.

**Summary:** identifies the service needs of battered Asian women, including language needs, ways in which services can be more culturally sensitive and culturally appropriate methods of outreach.

Jurak, J. (2004) Preventing Family Disintegration in Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Communities: A Partnership Approach. Perth: Multicultural Women's Consortium.

Location: Australia.

Targeted ethnicity: Ethiopian and Muslim.

Category: prevention.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** working groups were supported by a steering committee; community members were centrally involved. Issues were identified through focus groups. Evaluation was conducted through a survey undertaken by an independent research consultant in consultation with a community representative or bilingual worker.

**Summary:** reports on the pilot project 'Preventing Family Disintegration in Culturally and Linguistically Diverse Communities: A Partnership Approach,' which was launched in 2003 by the Multicultural Women's Consortium (MWC). The MWC comprised four NGOs in conjunction with the Ethiopian and Muslim communities in Perth. It aimed to work with ethnic communities in order to create awareness about issues relating to family violence and develop cohesive community networks with distinct goals. Describes the development process and the community-based projects that were undertaken.

Keller, Elizabeth M. and Brennan, Pauline K. (2007) 'Cultural Considerations and Challenges to Service Delivery for Sudanese Victims of Domestic Violence. Insights from service providers and actors in the criminal justice system.' *International Review of Victimology*, 14(1): pp. 115-41.

Location: United States.

Targeted ethnicity: Sudanese.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** interviewed victim advocates, workers in the criminal justice system and workers from community based agencies who work with Sudanese clients (eight interviews). Uses the 'ethno-gender approach' developed by M. Abraham.

**Summary:** article examines service provision to Sudanese victims of domestic violence in Nebraska, including barriers to service access. Includes a literature review of work on the cultural norms and practical constraints around domestic violence as they apply to immigrants generally. Describes recommendations for service providers that emerged from the interviews, including suggestions for interpreting and outreach.

Kennedy, Lee; Clarke, Heather; and Yong, Helene (1994) 'Vietnamese Women's Domestic Violence Poster Project'. In Paul Butler, *Innovation and Excellence in Community Health.* Victoria, Australia: Centre for Development and Innovation in Health.

**Location:** Australia.

Targeted ethnicity: Vietnamese.

Category: services for victims.

Methodology and/or theoretical perspective: descriptive article.

**Summary:** describes a project in which a group of Vietnamese women from the Vietnamese Domestic Violence Support Group in Melbourne were recruited to create a poster aimed at helping Vietnamese victims of domestic violence to access help.

MacLeod, Linda and Shin, Maria (1990) *Isolated, Afraid and Forgotten: the service delivery needs and realities of immigrant and refugee women who are battered.*Ottawa: National Clearinghouse on Family Violence, Health and Welfare, Canada.

Location: Canada.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** information was gathered from informal interviews conducted with workers working with battered ethnic women.

**Summary:** study focuses on service needs for battered immigrant women in Canada. Summarises the needs of battered immigrant women, lists barriers ethnic women face in accessing services, and describes the approach of ethnic domestic violence services. Several ethnic women's agencies are surveyed and two Canadian government strategies to tackle violence towards immigrant women (training women as cultural interpreters and setting up support groups for Spanish-speaking victims of violence, their children and their partners) are described.

Masaki, Beckie; Kim, Mimi; and Chung, Christy (1999) *The Multilingual Access Model:* a model for outreach and services in non-English speaking communities. Harrisburg, Pennsylvania: The National Research Center on Domestic Violence.

**Location:** United States.

Targeted ethnicity: Asian.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** description and guide to the Multilingual Access Model developed by the Asian Women's Shelter (San Francisco).

**Summary:** describes the Asian Women's Shelter's method of dealing with clients' inability to speak English, a model of communication called the 'Multilingual Access Model' that involves recruiting bilingual women in the community as on-call (paid) language advocates. Article gives a guide to setting up the Multilingual Access Model in other agencies.

Pan, A. et al. (2006) 'Understanding the Role of Culture in Domestic Violence: the Ahimsa Project for Safe Families'. *Journal of Immigrant and Minority Health*, 8(1): pp. 35-43.

**Location:** United States

Targeted ethnicity: Latino, Somali and Vietnamese

Category: prevention

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** a description of the Ahimsa Project in San Diego.

**Summary:** describes the Ahimsa Project, a group in San Diego dedicated to combating domestic violence in Somali, Vietnamese and Latino populations. Describes the needs assessment conducted in the community, summarises its findings and describes the initiatives (parenting programmes and sewing classes for women) that were consequently instigated. Gives some recommendations for service providers working with ethnic communities.

Pateras, Vasilka Vicki (1997) 'Accommodating Diversity: a NESB focussed women's refuge model'. Women Against Violence: an Australian feminist journal, 2: pp. 4-13.

Location: Australia.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** a critical appraisal of the cross-cultural and feminist model of the Women's Liberation Halfway House in Melbourne, Australia.

**Summary:** describes the Women's Liberation Halfway House, a multicultural refuge in Melbourne that endorses a feminist, multicultural approach to domestic violence intervention. Describes the process by which management and staff are selected and outlines the culturally sensitive way in which the refuge works with women.

Preisser, Amita Bhandari (1999) 'Domestic Violence in South Asian Communities in America: advocacy and intervention.' *Violence Against Women*, 5(6): pp. 684-99.

**Location:** United States.

Targeted ethnicity: South Asian.

**Category:** services for victims/treatment for offenders/prevention.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** research is based on the author's personal experience working with the Asian Women's Self-Help Association in Washington, D.C.

**Summary:** describes the Asian Women's Self-Help Association in Washington, D.C., a community organisation working with South Asian women in crisis, and the author's development of a 'culture-specific advocacy and intervention model' (pp. 684-5). Presents lists of intervention strategies for legal and social service providers.

Rees, Susan and Pease, Bob (2006) Refugee Settlement, Safety and Wellbeing: exploring domestic and family violence in refugee communities. Violence Against Women Community Attitudes Project 4. Victoria: Vic-Health-IWDVS.

Location: Australia.

Targeted ethnicity: refugees from Ethiopia, Sudan, Serbia, Bosnia, Croatia and Iraq.

**Category:** prevention/services for victims/treatment for offenders.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** intersectionality theory and a human rights framework; research was undertaken in eight focus groups using the 'story-board group work' method developed by Eileen Pittaway, and in-depth face-to-face interviews with men and women drawn from the focus groups.

**Summary:** describes research undertaken on domestic violence in the Ethiopian, Sudanese, Serbian, Bosnian, Croatian and Iraqi refugee communities in Victoria, Australia. Recommends a number of violence prevention strategies at the individual, community, organisational and structural levels; these strategies are intended to be carried out in partnership with refugee communities.

Rothman, Emily F. et al. (2007) 'Batterer Intervention Program Enrolment and Completion Amongst Immigrant Men in Massachusetts'. *Violence Against Women*, 13(5): pp. 527-42.

**Location:** United States.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

Category: treatment for offenders.

Methodology and/or theoretical perspective: statistical.

**Summary:** analyses immigrant men's completion rates of batterers' programmes in Massachusetts. It found that immigrant men were more likely to complete batterers' programmes than non-immigrant men, but that the language in which the groups were conducted made no statistical difference to their completion rates.

Rudrappa, Sharmila (2004) 'Radical Caring in an Ethnic Shelter: South Asian American women workers at Apna Ghar, Chicago'. *Gender and Society*, 18: pp. 588-610.

Location: United States.

Targeted ethnicity: South Asian.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** research is drawn from personal observation and tape-recorded life histories taken during the author's time as a volunteer and paid worker at Apna Ghar, a South Asian women's shelter in Chicago; it is supplemented by informal interviews conducted with four caregivers from Saheli, a domestic violence support group for Asian American women in Austin, Texas.

**Summary:** a description of Apna Ghar and a critical analysis of the contradictions inherent in the role of its workers. Details Apna Ghar's strategies to reduce violence, including attempts at community outreach.

Sharma, Anita (2001) 'Healing the Wounds of Domestic Abuse: improving the effectiveness of feminist therapeutic interventions with immigrant and racially visible women who have been abused'. *Violence Against Women*, 7(12): pp. 1405-1428.

Location: Canada.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

Category: services for victims.

Methodology and/or theoretical perspective: a critique of feminist theory.

**Summary:** critiques the feminist framework used by counsellors working with battered ethnic women and offers guidelines for culturally sensitive feminist therapy.

Simbandumwe, L. et al. (2008) 'Family Violence Prevention Programs in Immigrant Communities: perspectives of immigrant men'. *Journal of Community Psychology*, 36(7): pp. 899-914.

Location: Canada.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

Category: prevention.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** participatory action research; researchers consulted with seven focus groups of immigrant and/or refugee men and four individual interviews.

**Summary:** the first part of the article surveys violence prevention programmes and initiatives for ethnic communities in Canada and the literature on domestic violence prevention in ethnic communities. Several conclusions and recommendations are drawn from this. The second part of the article describes the Immigrant Men's Research Project in Winnipeg, Canada, which researched immigrant men's attitudes towards domestic violence. The authors outline the recommendations for primary prevention programmes arising from the focus groups.

Smith, Andrea (2005) 'Looking to the Future: domestic violence, women of color, the state and social change'. In Natalie J. Sokoloff (Ed), *Domestic Violence at the Margins: readings on race, class, gender and culture.* New Jersey: Rutgers UP.

**Location:** United States.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

Category: services for victims/treatment for offenders.

Methodology and/or theoretical perspective: postcolonial and feminist theory.

**Summary:** critiques current models of domestic violence from a postcolonial feminist perspective. Issues surveyed include state violence against ethnic women and community alternatives to state restorative justice programmes. Suggests some strategies for ending domestic violence in ethnic communities.

Tse, Samson (2007) 'Family Violence in Asian Communities: combining research and community development'. Social Policy Journal of New Zealand/Te Puna Whakaaro, 31: pp. 170-94.

Location: New Zealand.

Targeted ethnicity: Asian.

Category: services for victims.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** interviews with victims, perpetrators, family members and service providers, and a focus group.

**Summary:** article examines the nature of domestic violence in Asian communities in New Zealand, and barriers to seeking help. Includes a short discussion of the kinds of help that victims found useful, and several general recommendations for preventing and responding to family violence.

Venkatraman, Rugmini and Johar, Anoop (2001), 'Culturally Appropriate Strategies in Preventing Violence Against Women.' Conference workshop paper, Seeking Solutions: Australia's Inaugural Domestic Violence and Sexual Assault Conference, 5-7 September 2001.<sup>16</sup>

Location: Australia.

**Targeted ethnicity:** multiple; includes Arabic, Filipino, Pacific Islander, Indian Subcontinent and Aboriginal communities

Category: prevention.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** description of a workshop presentation on culturally appropriate domestic violence intervention strategies.

**Summary:** describes three projects targeting different ethnic groups in Western Sydney and Wentworth, Australia, which were part of the New South Wales Strategy to Reduce Violence Against Women. In these projects, communities produced culturally appropriate resources for their communities, such as posters, banners, community radio announcements, pens and videos that promoted the message of harmony in the home.

Wah, Lee Mun (2008) 'Asian Men and Violence'. In Ricardo Carrillo and Jerry Tello (Eds), *Family Violence and Men of Color: healing the wounded male spirit.* Second ed. New York: Springer.

Location: United States.

Targeted ethnicity: Asian.

Category: treatment for offenders.

**Methodology and/or theoretical perspective:** a description of an Asian Men's Group set up by the author, who was also a participant.

**Summary:** the author describes an Asian Men's Group that he formed in order to help Asian men deal with anger. Note: the group does not deal specifically with domestic violence. However, it offers strategies that are likely to be useful since, as the author argues, violent men often use violence because they do not know how to express their hurt.

\_

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>16</sup> http://www.austdvclearinghouse.unsw.edu.au/Conference%20papers/Seeksoln/Venkatraman,Rugmini\_Johar,A.pdf

Ziaian, Tahereh (1997) Celebrating our Success: responses to violence against non-English speaking background women. The report of the NESB Women and Violence Project, National Women's Health Program (Australia).

Location: Australia.

Targeted ethnicity: multiple.

Category: services for victims.

Methodology/theoretical approach: a report on a project aimed at domestic violence intervention in the non-English speaking community. Action research into best practice was used.

**Summary:** describes the Non-English Speaking Background (NESB) Women and Violence Project commissioned by the National Women's Health Program, South Australian Health Commission. The project comprised three main strategies:

- 1. establishing support networks for NESB women who have been abused
- 2. developing a training programme for workers from ethnic services and other agencies
- 3. research into best practice in addressing violence in NESB communities.

The report makes a number of recommendations for the creation and maintenance of such support groups and describes their benefits for clients. It includes surveys of the four support groups (one Filipino, two multicultural and one Cambodian) and summarises the successful elements of support groups, as detailed in the evaluation reports.

Ministry of Women's Affairs PO Box 10049 Wellington 6143

Phone: 04 9157112 Fax: 04 9161604 mwa@mwa.govt.nz www.mwa.govt.nz

ISBN: 978-0-478355-06-2 newzealand.govt.nz